

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

-----X

IBRAHIM TURKMEN, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

Order

02-CIV-2307(JG)

**JOHN ASHCROFT, Attorney General of the
United States, et al.,**

Defendants.

-----X

-----X

EHAB ELMAGHRABY, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

Order

04-CIV-1809(JG)

**JOHN ASHCROFT, Attorney General of the
United States, et al.,**

Defendants.

-----X

During a conference held on January 10, 2006, I directed defendants to produce documents from their personnel files. Although the parties agreed that certain personal identifying information could be redacted, I ordered that salary, pension and business interest information be produced. Tr. of January 10, 2006, at 12-13.

By letter dated January 25, 2006, docket entry 460 in 02-Civ-2307, defendants Zenk and Thomas move for reconsideration, arguing that the information I directed be produced is not relevant to plaintiffs' claims. As plaintiffs noted during the conference, however, the financial information at issue may well be relevant to claims for punitive damages. Moreover, the information does not raise the same privacy concerns as the personal identifying and family information I have already agreed should be redacted. Any request by defendants that their financial information be limited to attorneys'-eyes-only will, however, be granted. The motion of defendants Zenk and Thomas is accordingly denied.

SO ORDERED.

_____/s/_____
Steven M. Gold
United States Magistrate Judge

Brooklyn, New York
January 30, 2006

C:\MyFiles\Turkmen 013006.wpd